

## Coding Rules for Each Issue-Area

First, general rules for what variables we are going to code. Rather than trying to reach an overall judgment about compliance now, we are going to break down compliance into four dimensions:

### **Magnitude of Violations**

- 1=No violations at all
- 2=Minor violations only
- 3=Some major violations
- 4=Many major violations such that compliance doesn't matter

### **Frequency/Extent of Violations**

- 1=No violations at all
- 2=Single or occasional violations
- 3=Recurrent or common violations, with the standards still observed on many occasions
- 4=Massive violations to the point where the standard is ignored

### **Centralized control of violations**

- 1=No violations at all
- 2=Individual violations against state policy and which are punished by state policy
- 3=Individual violations not punished by state policy
- 4=Probable state decision to violate
- 5=Positive identification of state intent to violate

### **Clarity of violations**

- 1=No violations at all
  - 2=Legal Status of violation in clear dispute
  - 3=Probable violation, but not totally clear
  - 4=Definite legal violation
- Clarity of violation is originally coded by the current treaty in force now. Codings then corrected for the clarity of the violation at the time of the violation later.

### **Quality of Data/Evidence**

- 0=Standardized coding
  - 1=Evidence sketchy
  - 2=Example events documented, broad sweep of policy not documented
  - 3=Good confidence in evidence used for coding
  - 4=Excellent documentation, strong confidence in coding
- Note: Unsupported allegations do not count as evidence.

Notes: When separate violations exist where neither set of scores is greater than or equal to the other on all dimensions, the violation is coded by the following priorities: 1) most prevalent, 2) highest magnitude, and 3) highest quality of evidence. Also, any evidence overrules a standardized coding.

## **Types of violations, classified as major and minor for each issue-area by treaty**

### **Aerial Bombardment**

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.; Declaration (IV,1), to Prohibit, for the Term of Five Years, the Launching of Projectiles and Explosives from Balloons, and Other Methods of Similar Nature

Major Violations: Bombardment of undefended towns, dropping bombs or firing guns from balloons for the next five years

Hague 1907: Declaration (XIV) Prohibiting the Discharge of Projectiles and Explosives from Balloons

Extends earlier treaty indefinitely

Hague 1922-23 (not a treaty): Rules concerning the Control of Wireless Telegraphy in Time of War and Air Warfare.

Major Violations: Bombing civilians (military targets allowed except when "an indiscriminating bombardment of the civil population would result")

Minor Violations: Failure to mark military aircraft

Clarification: Nonmilitary aircraft not protected over enemy territory or in war zone

Amsterdam 1938 (not a treaty): Draft Convention for the Protection of Civilian Populations Against New Engines of War.

Major Violations: Terror bombing of civilians, Bombing of military targets that cannot be clearly recognized, Bombing of established safety zones

Minor Violations: Deceptive or improper use of safety zones

Clarifications: "A town, port, village or isolated building shall be considered undefended provided that not only (a) no combatant troops, but also (b) no military, naval or air establishment, or barracks, arsenal, munition stores or factories, aerodromes or aeroplane workshops or ships of war, naval dockyards, forts, or fortifications for defensive or offensive purposes, or entrenchments (in this Convention referred to as "belligerent establishments") exist within its boundaries or within a radius of "x" kilometres from such boundaries."

ICRC 1956 (not a treaty): Draft Rules for the Limitation of the Dangers incurred by the Civilian Population in Time of War.

Clarifies rules protecting civilian populations from aerial bombing

Major Violations: Incendiary bombing, Bombing civilian installations (dams, nuclear power plants, dykes, etc.)

Minor Violations: Placing military targets in large civilian populations

Edinburgh 1969 (not a treaty): The Distinction between Military Objectives and Non\_Military Objectives in General and Particularly the Problems Associated with Weapons of Mass Destruction.

Reiterates existing norms.

Geneva 1980: Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Incendiary Weapons (Protocol III).

Major Violations: Incendiary aerial attacks on civilians, except when military target located amid civilians

Minor Violations: Placing military targets amid civilians

Notes: Aerial bombardment of civilian areas falls under aerial bombardment rather than treatment of civilians.

Aerial bombardment includes missiles and rockets if fired from a great distance so they act like bombers rather than artillery. Otherwise, code as treatment of civilians.

### **Armistice/Flag of Truce**

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.

Major Violations: Attacks on individuals under a flag of truce, Violation of truce before expiry or without notification if armistice is indefinite length

Minor Violations: Use of flag of truce as ruse (allows attacks on such individuals in response), Considering individual violations as cause to terminate armistice

Hague 1907: Convention (IV) respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.

Reiterates above

Oxford 1913 (not a treaty): Manual of the Laws of Naval War

Major Violations: Failure to give warning of starting hostilities after period of truce

### **Chemical and Biological Weapons**

Hague 1899: Declaration (IV,2) concerning Asphyxiating Gases

Major Violations: "Use of projectiles the sole object of which is the diffusion of asphyxiating or deleterious gases," Employment of poison or poisoned weapons

Hague 1907: Convention (IV) respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land

Major Violations: Use of arms, projectiles, or material calculated to cause unnecessary suffering (note: vagueness of these provisions; these are quotes from the treaty); includes explosive bullets if their use is clearly documented

Washington 1922 (not a treaty): Treaty relating to the Use of Submarines and Noxious Gases in Warfare

Major Violations: "Use of asphyxiating, poisonous or other gases, and all analogous liquids, materials or devices"

Geneva 1925: Protocol for the Prohibition of the Use of Asphyxiating, Poisonous or Other Gases, and of Bacteriological Methods of Warfare

Major Violations: Bacteriological warfare

Is also the treaty with the same commitment as Washington 1922

Amsterdam 1938 (not a treaty): Draft Convention for the Protection of Civilian Populations Against New Engines of War

Major Violations: Incendiary attacks, except flares, flamethrowers, and incendiaries used against aircraft

Clarifications: Chemical weapons defined as "toxic, asphyxiating, irritant or vesicant substance," excluding chemical smoke, tear gas, and explosives and their byproducts. BW defined as "use for the purpose of injuring an adversary of all methods for the dissemination of pathogenic microbes or of filter-passing viruses, or of infected substances, whether for the purpose of bringing them into immediate contact with human beings, animals or plants, or for the purpose of affecting any of the latter in any manner whatsoever, as, for example, by polluting the atmosphere, water, foodstuffs or any other objects of human use or consumption."

Edinburgh 1969 (not a treaty): The Distinction between Military Objectives and Non\_Military Objectives in General and Particularly the Problems Associated with Weapons of Mass Destruction

Major Violations: Nuclear war (although tactical nuclear war might be allowed): "The use of weapons the destructive effect of which is so great that it cannot be limited to specific military objectives or is otherwise uncontrollable (self-generating weapons), as well as of "blind" weapons."

London 1972: Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction  
Major Violations: Proliferation of biological weapons to nonmember states of the treaty  
Makes the development, production, and stockpiling of biological agents illegal,  
Mandates destruction of existing biological agents within six months

Note: Tear gases are not considered chemical weapons in the codings. Use of just tear gas will be considered a minor violation (MAG = 2) with dispute over its legal status (CLAR = 2).

### **Treatment of Civilians**

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.

Major Violations: Bombardment of undefended towns, Pillage, Compulsion of occupied civilians to work for war effort, Taxes and requisitions on the civilian population beyond the needs of the occupying forces, General reprisals for acts of individuals, Punishment of irregulars who take arms before occupation

Minor Violations: Forcing population to take oath of loyalty to occupying power

Hague 1907: Convention (IV) respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land

Major Violations: Compulsion of enemy individuals to fight for your side; Forcing information from civilians, Suspension of domestic law/judicial process

Reiterates and clarifies some elements of Hague 1899

Oxford 1913 (not a treaty): Manual of the Laws of Naval War

Major Violations: Taking hostages, forcing civilians to work as guides or pilots

Tokyo 1934 (not a treaty): Draft International Convention on the Condition and Protection of Civilians of enemy nationality who are on territory belonging to or occupied by a belligerent

Major Violations: Failure to treat detained enemy civilians to the standard of POWs, Hostage taking from enemy civilians except when indispensable during military occupation, Reprisals against detained enemy civilians, Mixing POWs and detained civilians

Minor Violations: Detention of enemy civilians at the outbreak of war, except for military personnel and security risks

Amsterdam 1938 (not a treaty): Draft Convention for the Protection of Civilian Populations Against New Engines of War

Major Violations: Attacks on declared safety zones for mothers, children, and the elderly

Geneva 1949: Convention (IV) relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War

Major Violations: "willful killing, torture or inhuman treatment, including biological experiments, willfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health, unlawful deportation or transfer or unlawful confinement of a protected person, compelling a protected person to serve in the forces of a hostile Power, or willfully depriving a protected person of the rights of fair and regular trial prescribed in the present Convention, taking of hostages and extensive destruction and appropriation of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly."

Attacks on neutralized zones, civilian hospitals, or medical transport, Blockade of food, medicine, and clothing, Sexual abuse of women (rape or forced prostitution), Coercion/torture of women and children to extract information, Internment of civilians except when absolutely necessary, Deportations from occupied territory, Failure to ensure supply of food and medicine, Prevent operation of the Red Cross in occupied territory, Inadequate detention facilities, Pressure to join occupying armed forces

Minor Violations: Military use of protected facilities, Punishment of own nationals in occupied territory for political reasons alone, Failure to create information bureau, Failure to allow Red Cross access to detention camps

ICRC 1956 (not a treaty): Draft Rules for the Limitation of the Dangers incurred by the Civilian Population in Time of War

Major Violations: Use of civilians as shields, Attacks on civilian installations, such as dams and dykes (Note: attacks on such with military use is OK), Attacks on open towns, Area bombing including civilian areas; Uncharted minefields, Attacks on personal vehicles

Edinburgh 1969: The Distinction between Military Objectives and Non\_Military Objectives in General and Particularly the Problems Associated with Weapons of Mass Destruction

Reiterates existing agreements

Geneva 1977: Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)  
Extends protections to "armed conflicts which peoples are fighting against colonial domination and alien occupation and against racist regimes in the exercise of their right of self-determination."

Geneva 1980: Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Incendiary Weapons (Protocol III)

Major Violations: Incendiary attacks on civilians

**Cultural Property ("historic monuments, museums, scientific, artistic, educational and cultural institutions")**

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land

Major Violations: Failure to take care to avoid destruction of cultural property

Minor Violations: Use of cultural property for military purposes when so marked, Failure to mark cultural property

Hague 1907: Convention (IX) concerning Bombardment by Naval Forces in Time of War  
Clarifications: Extends protection to include naval bombardment; Prescribes a specific sign for cultural property, Adds historical monuments

Washington 1935: Treaty on the Protection of Artistic and Scientific Institutions and Historic Monuments (Roerich Pact).

Adds: Protection for personnel of cultural property. Educational institutions added.

Changes the flag used to denote cultural property

Hague 1954: Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict; Protocol for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict.

Major Violations: Looting of cultural property during military occupation; Attacks on transportation of moveable cultural property

Adds: Moveable cultural property, such as books, art, and scientific collections

More detailed definition of cultural property--adds historic districts of cities, Changes the emblem used to denote cultural property, Use of UNESCO as neutral go-between/observer for cultural property issues--not mandatory

**Conduct on the High Seas (including submarine warfare)**

Paris 1856: Declaration Respecting Maritime Law

Major Violations: Privateering, Sporadic blockade, Use of neutral flag to cover enemy goods, Attacks on enemy shipping not carrying war material

Hague 1899: Convention (III) for the Adaptation to Maritime Warfare of the Principles of the Geneva Convention of 22 August 1864.

Major Violations: Attacks on hospital ships, Attacks on wounded or shipwrecked sailors

Minor Violations: Duplicitious use of hospital ships

Hague 1907: Convention (VI) relating to the Status of Enemy Merchant Ships at the Outbreak of Hostilities; Convention (VII) relating to the Conversion of Merchant Ships into War\_Ships; Convention (VIII) relative to the Laying of Automatic Submarine Contact Mines; Convention (IX) concerning Bombardment by Naval Forces in Time of War; Convention (X) for the Adaptation to Maritime Warfare of the Principles of the Geneva Convention; Convention (XI) relative to certain Restrictions with regard to the Exercise of the Right of Capture in Naval War.

Major Violations: Detention of enemy merchant ships at the outbreak of war, Duplicitious armed merchantmen, Illegal naval mines: targeting merchant shipping or freefloating, Naval bombardment of civilian targets (Note: definition is loose here because of military targets), Attacks on fishing, postal, religious and scientific boats, Capturing merchant seamen

Minor Violations: Failure to aid sick and shipwrecked enemy sailors, Failure to transmit information about dead and captured sailors, Destruction of submarine cables (for telegraph/telephone) between enemy and neutrals, Failure of adopt legislation against violations

London 1909 (not a treaty): Declaration concerning the Laws of Naval War

Major Violations: Illegal blockade: ineffective, distant, blockade of neutral ports, attacks on neutral shipping without search, failure to declare blockade

Oxford 1913 (not a treaty, does reflect treaty interpretation): Manual of the Laws of Naval War

Minor Violations: Destruction of any submarine cable

Clarifications: Attacks on enemy merchant shipping without warning/search is illegal/major violation

Washington 1922 (not a treaty): Treaty relating to the Use of Submarines and Noxious Gases in Warfare.

Major Violations: Unrestricted submarine warfare: attack without search, warning, or allowing the crew to abandon ship

Hague 1922-23 (not a treaty): Rules concerning the Control of Wireless Telegraphy in Time of War and Air Warfare.

Minor Violations: Failure to conform to codes for distress messages

Clarification: Ships that radio military information are fair game to attack without warning

London 1930: Treaty for the Limitation and Reduction of Naval Armaments, (Part IV, Art. 22, relating to submarine warfare). (limited to 5 years)

Major Violations: Unrestricted submarine warfare

London 1936 (not a treaty): Procès-verbal relating to the Rules of Submarine Warfare set forth in Part IV of the Treaty of London of 22 April 1930.

Major Violations: Unrestricted submarine warfare

Geneva 1949: Convention (II) for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea.

Major Violations: Taking hostages, Outrages to dignity, Nonjudicial executions (parallels POW rules)

Clarifies and adds detail to earlier rules

## **POWs**

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.

Major Violations: Failure to provide adequate shelter, clothing or food for POWs [Note: these standards are unclear in this treaty], Failure to establish POW bureau and disseminate information on POWs, Denial of access of relief societies to POWs, Employment of POWs in war effort or excessive work, Summary execution on the battlefield, No quarter

Minor Violations: Deceptive use of uniforms, Failure to honor parole, Charges or restraint on mail/packages to/from POWs, Looting of POWs

Hague 1907: Convention (IV) respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land.

Add

Minor Violations: Failure to inform one's own soldiers about POW rights and responsibilities

Clarification of allowable activity: Discrimination between officers and ranks

Oxford 1913: Manual of the Laws of Naval War

Clarification: POW rules applied to sailors captured at sea

Geneva 1929: Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War

Add

Major Violations: Exposure to harm by not evacuating POWs from battlefield, Failure to provide medical care, Excessive work or unhealthy or dangerous work, Standard of shelter, clothing and food lower than captor state's soldiers, Cruel or collective punishments, nonjudicial punishments of POWs for crimes, excessive disciplinary punishments, Torture of POWs to gain information,

Minor Violations: Failure to protect women POWs, Failure to separate races or nationalities, Camps in unhealthy climates, Denying the right of complaint to POWs

Geneva 1949: Convention (III) relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War

Add:

Major Violations: Shelter or food prejudicial to the health of POWs



Minor Violations: Discrimination on the basis of race, nationality, religious belief or political opinions, or any other distinction founded on similar criteria, failure to mark POW camps visible from the air, failure to post treaty in POW camps

Clarifications: List of acceptable work for POWs, pay to POWs given in Swiss francs

Geneva 1977: Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)

Add:

Extends POW protections to "armed conflicts which peoples are fighting against colonial domination and alien occupation and against racist regimes in the exercise of their right of self-determination."

### **Declaration of War**

Hague 1907: Convention (III) relative to the Opening of Hostilities

Major Violations: Sneak attack without declaration of war

Note: Attack without any warning is magnitude 4 and clarity 4. Attack in response to ultimatum is magnitude 2 and clarity 2. Sneak attack launched after ultimatum but much earlier than deadline is magnitude 3 and clarity 3. Slow escalation of fighting from border struggles without a clear attack is magnitude 3 and clarity 3. Frequency gives size/number of attacks launched at the start of hostilities.

### **Treatment of Wounded**

Geneva 1864: Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded in Armies in the Field

Major Violations: Attacks on hospitals, medical personnel, ambulances, or civilians housing the wounded

Minor Violations: Failure to mark medical facilities with Red Cross

Hague 1899: Convention (II) with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land; Convention (III) for the Adaptation to Maritime Warfare of the Principles of the Geneva Convention of 22 August 1864.

Add:

Major Violations: Firing on hospital ships

Clarifications: Extends protections to sailors at sea

Geneva 1906: Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armies in the Field.

Add:

Major Violations: Failure to care for enemy wounded who are captured, Disbanding enemy convoys of medical ships

Minor Violations: Use of medical signs as military ruse; Failure to seek out enemy wounded after battle, Active combat by medical personnel; Failure to transmit information on enemy dead and wounded

Hague 1907: Convention (X) for the Adaptation to Maritime Warfare of the Principles of the Geneva Convention.

Clarification: Prescribes specific markings for hospital ships

Geneva 1929: Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armies in the Field.

Add:

Minor Violations: Failure to quickly release captured medical personnel

Clarifications: Extends protection to hospital aircraft; Allows use of Red Crescent and Sun and Lion as marker

Monaco 1934 (not a treaty): First draft Convention adopted in Monaco (Sanitary cities and localities),

Add (only if such cities have ever been established):

Major violations: Attacks on duly constituted sanitary cities; deceptive use of such cities

Geneva 1949: Convention (I) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field; Convention (II) for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea.

Add:

Major Violations: Reprisals against the wounded, Lesser treatment than POWs receive

Minor Violations: Failure to punish offenders

Geneva 1977: Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)

Add:

Extends protections to "armed conflicts which peoples are fighting against colonial domination and alien occupation and against racist regimes in the exercise of their right of self-determination."

Note: On determining date of first violation, choose date of first report of violation for violations that are generally traced to the actions of individuals, such as POW, civilians, and wounded. When first violation occurs at an unspecified time during a battle, choose the first date of the battle.